

**REPORT OF
THE BOARD OF VISITORS,
NATIONAL DEFENSE UNIVERSITY MEETING
Held on December 1, 2023**



**A public meeting was held on December 1, 2023 by the Board of Visitors,
National Defense University in Marshall Hall, Room 155, Fort McNair,
Washington DC, 20319**

Date of this Report: April 8, 2024


Norton A. Schwartz, General, USAF (Ret.)
Chair

**National Defense University
Board of Visitors Meeting
December 1, 2023
MINUTES**

The National Defense University Board of Visitors (BOV) met on December 1, 2023. The attendance roster and agenda are attached in Appendix A and B.

**0900 Call to Order, Administrative Notes
 Ms. Joycelyn Stevens, Alternate Designated Federal Officer
 (ADFO)**

<Slide 1>

Ms. Joycelyn Stevens

Good morning. I am Joycelyn Stevens, the Alternate Designated Federal Officer for the Board of Visitors, National Defense University under the provisions of Public Law 92-463. I would like to welcome everyone to today's Board meeting. NDU'S Board of Visitors is chartered under the authority of the Secretary of Defense to provide independent advice and recommendations on the overall management and governance of NDU in achieving its mission. NDU's senior leaders are present to address issues, answer questions or to clarify information as well as to listen to the board's recommendations.

This meeting is open to the public from now until 1500 that's 3 PM this afternoon, December 1st, 2023. The University appreciates the significant and conscientious time and work of our Board members in preparing for this meeting and for their forthcoming deliberations. I and the Board also wish to thank my NDU colleagues for all their efforts and the support of the NDU Foundation in preparing for this meeting.

Now regarding meeting operations: public observation of the NDU Board of Visitors meeting is in person, pursuant to the Federal Advisory Committee Act of 1972, written statements to the Board may be submitted at any time by email or fax, to Ms. Joycelyn Stevens at bov@ndu.edu or fax 202-685-3920. Any written statements will be distributed to the Board of Visitors, National Defense University, in the order received. All comments received will be preserved as public records of

the meeting. Copies of all meeting materials and public comments will be available on the NDU BOV website. There were no comments received for this meeting.

Now I need to emphasize the importance of using your microphones. We have virtual board members and the NDU audience that need to hear what is being discussed. Please ensure that your green light is on and speak into the microphone, but more importantly, please ensure that the green light is off when you're not speaking or if you're going to say something that you do not want transmitted. In closing, again, I would wish to thank the board for your participation in today's meeting.

And with that, Mr. Chairman, the Board of Visitors, National Defense University, is hereby called to order in accordance with the provisions of Public Law 92-463.

Gen (Ret.) Norton Schwartz – Board Chair: Ms. Stevens, thank you for your remarkable service in gathering us all today. In this meeting we have Ambassador Myrick to my right, the Vice Chair, Admiral Breckenridge to my left, General Hooper is to my right, Colonel Marcos to my left and The Honorable Ms. Wada to my right. Remotely we have Dr. Logan and Dr. Patil. And unfortunately, today, Ambassador Roemer has a family issue and will not be able to join us. I would like to acknowledge some new arrivals, if I may, Mr. President. We have new commandants at at least three of the university's colleges, National, Eisenhower and the Joint Forces Staff College. And finally, Dr. Kate Kuehn is here. And Dr. Kuehn, when she is ultimately certified, will become the next Designated Federal Officer, succeeding our wonderful DFO for many years. And so with that, why don't we proceed with the agenda? And we'll start with the state of the university presented by the President, Colonel Plehn, or General Plehn. Excuse me, I remember a prior day.

**0904-0934 State of the University Address
Lieutenant General Michael T. Plehn, NDU President**

Lieutenant General Plehn

As do I Sir, thank you very much. Well, good morning. And first of all, thanks again to the National Defense University Foundation for their support of the receptions both yesterday and today.

To our esteemed Chair, Vice Chair, and Members of the NDU Board of Visitors (BoV), we are pleased to welcome you back to the National Defense University for your final meeting of 2023. Today, we will provide an update on four important

areas of effort for NDU: 1) reaffirming our civilian accreditation; 2) improving our infrastructure and personnel posture; 3) inculcating ethics into our academic programs as we transition to Outcomes-Based Military Education, and; 4) engaging the broader national security community. You will receive a more detailed update on these areas throughout today's discussions, but I would summarize it all by saying we continue to make substantive progress along the journey to continually improve our University.

Before continuing with the rest of the agenda, I would like to take a moment to remember the vibrant life and extraordinary contributions of a long-time NDU colleague. On October 19, Ms. Mollie Murphy passed away unexpectedly. Mollie served as the NDU General Counsel for more than 21 years, having previously served as a Judge Advocate General in the U.S. Air Force. She was a trusted counselor and confidante to not only me, but to university leaders, faculty, and staff who relied on her legal acumen, candor, and discretion. Her passing has been a profound loss to her many friends and colleagues throughout the NDU family.

At your previous BoV meeting in May, I reported what we believed was a successful visit in March by the accreditation reaffirmation evaluation team from the Middle States Commission on Higher Education (MSCHE). In the evaluation team's judgment, NDU appeared to meet all MSCHE standards and requirements of affiliation, but the decision to reaffirm NDU's accreditation ultimately rests with the full Commission, which met in June to vote on all pending accreditation reaffirmation packages. On June 29, MSCHE issued a Notification of Non-Compliance Action to NDU after reviewing our accreditation package, noting they did not see sufficient evidence of compliance with Standard V, Educational Effectiveness Assessment. Middle States also requested further evidence of compliance with all applicable federal, state, and Commission policies and regulations (as required under Standard II) and further evidence of the implementation of organized and systematic assessments that evaluate institutional effectiveness (as required under Standard VI).

While this decision came as a surprise to us, ensuring the continued growth and sustained excellence of our University is a fundamental priority. Although we had conducted an intensive self-study in preparation for the evaluation visit, the non-compliance notification prompted us to look even more closely and candidly at ourselves. In so doing, we found some things we had initially missed and are making corrections to ensure compliance with all Middle States requirements. At the recommendation of one of our NDU Board of Visitors members, we searched for, and brought on board, several Expert Consultants with a deep understanding of

assessment and accreditation processes to inform our efforts. We also formed five NOV -wide teams to implement programs, policies, and processes to ensure current and future compliance. We are on track to deliver a required Monitoring Report to Middle States by January 16, 2024, and will support a follow-on visit by another one of their evaluation teams in March 2024.

Our monitoring report will include a complete resubmission of Standard V evidence demonstrating how NDU has achieved and can sustain ongoing compliance with Educational Effectiveness Assessment requirements. It also will include further evidence of compliance with all applicable federal, state, and Commission policies and regulations (Standard II); notably, we will demonstrate compliance with federal and Department of Defense regulations on Human Subjects Research and Institutional Review Boards (IRB). Our report will also provide further evidence of organized and systematic assessments of institutional effectiveness, which will be demonstrated in part by the completion of our Implementation Plan in support of the NDU Strategic Plan.

To further strengthen our assessment capabilities, we have also made substantial progress in fielding our new NDU Connect information system that will enhance our ability to capture, analyze, and report student assessment data. We will also incorporate other business support systems into the platform to streamline data management and communicate meaningful insights to decision makers. We have reached initial operating capability with NDU Connect and are using it for two courses that will begin in January. With the information we gather from this initial rollout, we will make any necessary adjustments and begin fielding the system in our other colleges and programs beginning in the Spring of 2024. The Chief Operating Officer can provide additional details later this morning, but I would note this has been a significant whole-of-NDU effort for more than 2 years, and I am immensely proud of the team's work to get us to this point.

So, while ensuring compliance with MSCHE accreditation requirements is paramount, our ability to sustain compliance is equally important. The Provost will talk more about the work we've done to clarify, strengthen, and streamline key NDU processes and policies. He will also describe some of the organizational modifications we've undertaken to enhance staff capacity and ensure appropriate oversight of academic affairs across the University. I would like to emphasize as we go through this effort, NDU remains an accredited institution throughout the process.

Even as we do the critical work inherent in accreditation reaffirmation to improve

our University, NDU continues to deliver outstanding educational programs for the joint warfighting community. This past June, we graduated 644 students from our Joint Professional Military Education - Phase II (JPME II) Master's Degree-granting programs. These students represented all branches of the U.S. military and 18 Department of Defense agencies; 22 other Federal agencies, including the State Department and Homeland Security; industry partners, and 74 allied and partner nations. The current class of full-time JPME II students comprises 667 students representing all U.S. military services, including Space Force; 143 International Fellows from 80 allied, partner, and friendly nations; 5 private sector fellows, and government employees from 30 federal agencies across the US national security community, including the departments of Defense, State, Homeland Security, Energy, and others.

To ensure our students, faculty, and staff have a safe and productive learning and work environment-and in line with the Strategic Goals you approved for our University- we have vigorously sought additional funding from OSD and the Joint Staff-and I'm pleased to say they are providing additional resources. We are making improvements to NDU facilities across the board. As one small, but important example, we are installing water bottle-filling stations in Lincoln and Marshall Halls in response to student requests. The Chief Operating Officer will cover these improvements in more detail, and they include both the Fort McNair and Norfolk campuses.

Restoration and modernization of Eisenhower Hall continues, but the project completion date has slipped by 1 year, largely due to a delay in beginning the roof repairs caused by a sub-contractor delay in removing the solar panel array on the old roof. We estimate beneficial occupancy of the building in February 2026, and will provide more details in this morning's discussion on facilities.

The engineering design study for the restoration and modernization of Roosevelt Hall, historic home to the National War College, is progressing well. The study began in March and should be complete in the next four months. Based on the 65% design we received in September, the current project cost estimate is \$65 million. We would look to compete this requirement for funding in FY25 or FY26 at the latest. The Chief Operating Officer will provide additional specifics in her briefing.

In previous BoV meetings, you have encouraged us to pay close attention to our technology infrastructure as well as our physical infrastructure. Our team, led by the COO, has been aggressively- and effectively- engaging both OSD and the Joint Staff regarding our technology improvement and modernization requirements.

Earlier this year, we submitted an unfunded request to modernize our wireless network and we received an additional \$3.3M from OSD at the end of FY23 to begin this project. We deeply appreciate the Pentagon's demonstrated support for additional procurement funding for our IT requirements in FY24 and beyond.

Additionally, on the technology front, NDU is currently undergoing a U.S. Cyber Command Cyber Readiness Inspection. This 2-week inspection provides an in-depth review of our security practices, ensuring compliance with Department of Defense standards. During the preparation for this inspection our Information Technology Directorate (ITD) updated or wrote more than 20 policies, upgraded numerous network devices to ensure the highest levels of security, and facilitated the decommissioning and disposal of numerous outdated equipment. The preparation for this inspection required thousands of personnel Hours and tens of thousands of patches and firmware updates across a wide array of software and hardware. The results of this inspection will be outbriefed to us on 8 December.

As part of our preparations for this inspection, we also updated our Continuity of Operations Plan to ensure we can continue to perform mission essential functions during a range of emergency conditions. This was the first major update of our plan since 2017 and incorporated lessons learned from delivering academic programs during the pandemic. One major change is the transition to a hybrid/telework option; the previous plan involved physically relocating mission essential functions to an alternate facility.

Shifting into the personnel realm, in your June 13, 2023 letter to the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, you expressed concern with succession planning as three of NDU's five colleges were changing leadership this summer. We acknowledged the risk inherent in concurrent senior leader transitions and endeavored to make this transition as smooth as possible-and we have. As a result, MajGen Paul Rock, MajGen Bill Seely, and Maj Gen Tom Crimmins all hit the ground running as they took on their commandant responsibilities at NWC, ES, and JFSC, respectively. Similarly, Ambassador Andrew Young joined the NDU leadership team in June as Director of the International Student Management Office; his previous assignment was as Deputy Commander for Civil-Military Engagement at U.S. Africa Command. In an additional, unforecasted change of leadership, Ms. Denise Marsh-a career member of the Senior Foreign Service-is now serving as Acting Chancellor of the College of International Security Affairs (CISA); we are interviewing candidates to replace Ambassador Greta Holtz, who departed CISA and became President and CEO of a non-governmental organization in August.

Our goal is to fill all positions with the strongest candidates as quickly as possible, maximize retention, and ensure continuity of operations throughout any personnel changes. One way we do this is by increasing the efficiency of our hiring, and in FY23 we substantially improved our time-to-hire new personnel. Shortening time-to-hire is vital, and we have achieved net gains of positions filled in FY22 and FY23. We currently have many positions in the hiring pipeline and will continue aggressively hiring in FY24.

While we are working hard to hire additional teammates, the reality is the NDU budget still does not fund all the civilian positions we are authorized-in FY23, we spent \$53.5M in civilian pay, a substantial increase over FY22. For FY24, in accordance with our spend plan that we approved in August, we are allocating \$59M for civilian pay. Even so, this level of funding still falls short of the roughly \$65M we would need to fully fund our authorized personnel positions. The Chief Operating Officer will address our personnel situation in greater detail in her briefing.

At your previous BoV meeting, we discussed re-establishing a Center for Professional Ethics; the Board expressed unanimous endorsement for this initiative in its June 13, 2023 letter to the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff. While establishing a full-up Center for Professional Ethic will require additional resourcing we currently do not have, within our current resources we have made important progress. We formed an NDU Ethics Committee in March; it comprises the ethics chairs of each component college and select at-large members. We also added an ethics-focused Institutional Learning Outcome to "Apply principles governing the profession of arms, civil-military relations, and ethics to support strategic level decision-making." This is significant because every academic program will have to achieve this outcome. We will brief you in further detail on our overall progress later this morning.

In addition to re-energizing our Ethics Program, another way we enable Student, Alumni, and Stakeholder success is through our annual Alumni Continuing Education Security Seminars (ACCESS), in which we take education and engagement opportunities to our international graduate s. We rotate through the global regions over the years and in August, we hosted the symposium in Prague, Czech Republic, for 103 alumni from 42 countries. At this event, we also inducted 5 distinguished international alumni into our International Hall of Fame, including:

- Moldovan Minister of Defense and National War College graduate Anatolie Nosatii
- Eisenhower School (ES) graduate General (Ret.) Andres Centino,

Presidential Advisor on the West Philippine Sea and former Chief of Staff of the Armed Forces of the Philippines

- Inspector for the Polish Navy, Rear Admiral Jaroslaw Ziemianski, who is an ES alumnus
- Commander of the Maritime Component Command of the Polish Navy, Rear Admiral Krzysztof Jaworski, who also graduated from the Eisenhower School

Earlier, in July, we also inducted NWC graduate General Daniel Petrescu, Chief of Defense Staff of the Romanian Armed Forces into the International Hall of Fame. Similarly, since your last meeting, we inducted two of our most distinguished U.S. graduates into our National Hall of Fame. In September we inducted the former commander of U.S. Special Operations Command, General (Ret.) Charlie Holland; and we also inducted *in absentia* at his request, former Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, General (Ret.) Hugh Shelton.

We understand the importance of ongoing stakeholder engagement to inform our improvement efforts based on changing stakeholder needs. During your last meeting in May, I reported NDU's selection to co-host with the NATO Defense College the 53rd annual NATO Conference of Commandants in May 2024. This is the first time this conference will be held in the United States and it coincides with the 75th anniversary year of the signing of the North Atlantic Treaty right here in Washington, D.C. I'm pleased to report the NATO Defense College conducted a successful site visit to NDU and Washington, D.C. in October to finalize the agenda and other requirements. The NDU team is fully engaged and looking forward to co-hosting this historic event.

In addition to building our team, we are also striving to improve our culture and quality of life at NDU. One example is the standardized promotion board cycle we have instituted for both instructional and non-instructional faculty, such as our library professionals. In June, we promoted 38 military and Interagency instructors to assistant professor rank. This Fall we promoted 6 instructional and 3 non-instructional faculty members. Another example is the awards programs, which are designed to recognize and reward faculty and staff who demonstrated outstanding performance and who exemplify the values of our university.

In our continuing efforts to enhance NDU's culture and climate, we created a new Culture and Climate Advisory Council (CCAC), championed by our Senior Vice President, Ambassador Roxanne Cabral. This new council serves as an independent advisory group to provide NDU leadership with advice and

recommendations on diversity, equity, inclusion, accessibility, and transparent communication as they relate to improving operational effectiveness and organizational performance. It has more than a dozen volunteers from across NDU and has three co-leads: ES Commandant MajGen Bill Seely, Staff Advisory Council (SAC) Chair Ms. Nakia Logan from the College of Information and Cyberspace, and SAC Vice Chair Ms. Michelle Germany from our Operations directorate. In addition, Ambassador Cabral is also championing a newly created Student Leader Advisory Council to get regular feedback from student class presidents and vice presidents from each of the colleges.

While we continue to make significant progress in many areas, one issue we have not yet been able to advance is finding the legal mechanism to enable Department of State annuitants and other non-DoD federal retirees to join the NDU team without experiencing an offset to their retired pay. In his 27 August reply letter to you, then-Chairman General Mark Milley expressed support for seeking an institutional advocate for this issue. We will keep this initiative on our list of important objectives and seek to move it forward.

I would also note the new Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, General CQ Brown, already has been showing his strong support for the Chairman's University, having been here several times since early October, supporting our CAPSTONE course for newly promoted generals and admirals. He also recently attended our CAPSTONE annual review and engaged with our Senior Fellows and CAPSTONE staff for 2 hours.

As I prepare to close this State of the University address, I would like to note two very significant upcoming anniversary observances we will have at NDU. First is the College of International Security Affairs (CISA) that turns 20 years old this year. CISA is the DoD flagship for education and the building of partner capacity in the fields of irregular warfare and combating terrorism, at the strategic level. Demand for counterterrorism and irregular warfare education grew following the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001. CISA was founded in 2003 in response to this demand and in 2006 began delivering a 10-month Master of Arts degree in Strategic Security Studies for the fellows in its International Counterterrorism Fellowship program. Since its founding, CISA has produced over 2,000 graduates from 108 countries, who are skilled critical thinkers and complex problem solvers able to find solutions for complex issues in the international security arena. We are celebrating CISA's 20th anniversary with a series of stakeholder engagements, including a Chancellor's Lecture Series featuring the commander of U.S. Army Pacific, General Charles A. Flynn, and hosting the third Irregular Warfare

Symposium next week.

Second, we will observe the 100th anniversary of our oldest college, the Dwight D. Eisenhower School for National Security and Resource Strategy, next year. Originally founded as the Army Industrial College in 1924, it was given a broader charter by General Eisenhower as the Industrial College of the Armed Forces in 1946 and subsequently renamed the Eisenhower School in 2012. Our congratulations to both CISA and the Eisenhower School on these significant milestones.

Finally, I would assure you the NDU team is dedicated, hard-working, and continues to deliver the premier joint professional military education as we progress along our three Lines of Effort to: Enable student, alumni, and stakeholder success; Improve our University, and; Develop our Team. We are driving toward the goals set in our strategic and implementation plans, as we also address our most immediate priority of ensuring the continued accreditation of our University. Your continued guidance and support remains a critical component of our current and future success; thank you for your steadfast support that is enabling and enhancing the important work of the National Defense University. I would be happy to take your questions.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Mr. President, thank you for that very comprehensive presentation. I have two questions that which may be deferred to subsequent presentations. With regard to NDU Connect, can you relay what the major software products are that comprise NDU Connect?

Lt Gen Plehn: Yes sir, and Ms. Kolbe will cover this a little bit in her section which is going to broadly cover facilities, hiring, and a number of other issues. We have a variety of systems that range from our student information system, learning management system, and others that are going to be brought together under one connective platform as it were. It's not going to replace all those systems; it's going to integrate all those systems. Sir, if you'd like, I can ask Ms. Kolbe to amplify a little bit right now.

Ms. Kolbe: Gen Schwartz, it's the NDU Connect enterprise data management platform & it is being built on the Salesforce software in an educational data architecture.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Say again?

Ms. Kolbe: It's being built on the Salesforce platform with an educational architecture, used in universities across the country.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you. Second question: given that the out brief is just a week away from CYBERCOM. Do you have any insights yet from that inspection?

Lt Gen Plehn: Yes sir, we do. Ms. Kolbe just sent me an update last night. Our Chief Information Officer, Jim Lowery, is in the room with us. They've identified eighteen key areas right now, we've been able to mitigate six of those immediately on the spot. There's a few of them we just will not be able to mitigate during this timeframe, but we will take those for action in the future. And we'll get a more fulsome out brief next Friday. Over.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: I assume that none of those are significant security concerns, none of the remaining 12 of 18 that are not mitigated?

Lt Gen Plehn: Sir, we won't have the full detail for another week.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you.

Lt Gen Plehn: You're welcome.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Anyone else? Mr. Vice Chair?

AMB (Ret.) Bismarck Myrick – Vice Chair: Thank you, Mr. President for that fair and effective briefing. I just have a curiosity question: Does NDU have a faculty presence at the NATO Defence College?

Lt Gen Plehn: No sir, we integrate with them, but none of our faculty are assigned to the NATO Defence College.

LTG (Ret.) Charles Hooper: General, I want to thank you so much for that fantastic briefing as always. Two quick comments – I'm very gratified to hear that 3.3 million has been dedicated to IT modernization. If it is not enough, let us know what we can do to help.

Lt Gen Plehn: Yes, sir. On that note, the Pentagon is favorably addressing our request for additional procurement funds beyond FY24. They're actually planning on giving us additional funds in 24 as well.

LTG (Ret.) Hooper: Oh, that's good to hear. And then second is, I'm very glad to hear about the progress that we are making towards the permanent establishment of the center for professional ethics. As we move forward in the process, and since we're early in the process, I would suggest that perhaps we consider, certainly the center of gravity for the center for professional excellence is the US student body, but I would ask us to consider how we might interface with the international students here as well. Certainly would be along a different tact, and not the same, but professional ethics I think would be important to impart on our international students in some form or fashion while they're here in the United States before they go home.

Lt Gen Plehn: Yes sir, could not agree more. And certainly in all of our courses we emphasize respect for human rights and the importance of civilian control of the military. You will receive a more detailed briefing on the current status of our ethics program and where we're headed later this morning.

LTG (Ret.) Hooper: Thank you very much.

COL (Ret.) Nora Marcos: Just two comments: One, I appreciate the leadership emphasis on the CCRI [U.S. Cyber Command Cyber Readiness Inspection] - your running notes and updates that I see on the [Sunday] Skim. A lot of people think the CCRI is an IT issue, and it is, but it is obviously a leadership issue. The defense of the network is critical, so I appreciate that. And the other thing was, I appreciate your emphasis and the rest of the leadership here on traditions and culture. Coming to the convocation was awesome. It's awesome to see that you're continuing that tradition, as well as the hall of fame - all that matters. To hear that 104, 103 alumni came to Prague to get together with their brothers and sisters from forty-two countries, that's just phenomenal, and I applaud you and the staff for continuing to make that happen.

Lt Gen Plehn: Thank you, ma'am. They definitely work very hard at it. We receive tremendous support from the NDU Foundation, and certainly our International Student Management Office team does tremendous work in making that a success. On the CCRI, certainly Ms. Kolbe, Mr. Lowry and the entire university has been strongly focused on that for several months. I will be honest, we found some things that we really needed to tighten up, and Jim and his team have done yeoman's work on doing that. We'll probably find some other things throughout the course of the inspection as well.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Does Dr. Patil or Dr. Logan have something from Zoomland?

Dr. DJ Patil: I'm good for right now. I'll wait until the other presentations. Thank you.

Dr. Suzanne Logan: Likewise.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Mr. President, thank you for your presentation.

Lt Gen Plehn: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Thank you, Board members. Mr. Chairman, if you're ready, I'll be followed by the Provost to give an update on accreditation.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Let's go.

**0935-0955 Reaffirmation of Middle States Commission on Higher
Education Accreditation Update
Dr. James Lepse, Provost**

<Slide 2>

<Slide 3>

Dr. Lepse: Good morning. Mr. Chairman with your permission, I'll begin the presentation.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Yes.

<Slide 4>

Dr. Lepse: As mentioned in the State of the University address, NDU received a Notification of Non-Compliance from the Middle States Commission on Higher Education in June. This notification came after a multi-year effort to complete our self-study, which was provided to Middle States in early February of this year and followed by an evaluation team visit in March. While the team stated at the outset we appeared to meet all seven standards, the Commission requested that NDU provide a monitoring report with additional evidence. In the meantime, NDU remains accredited.

Specifically, the Notification letter specifically requested that we provide a Monitoring Report back to the MSCHE no later than 16 January 2024, addressing three areas of concern:

First, Evidence that NDU is in compliance with Standard V (*Educational Effectiveness Assessment*) of their Standards for Accreditation and Requirements for Affiliation.

Two, further evidence of compliance with Standard II, *Ethics and Integrity*, and three, Further evidence of compliance with Standard VI, *Planning, Resources, and Institutional Improvement*.

As you may recall, several board members attended a meeting with our assigned Middle States Vice President for Institutional Field Relations, Dr. Terence Peavy, on July 17th to discuss the notification letter and monitoring report expectations. We greatly appreciate your attendance and engagement at the meeting. We have conducted further discussions with Dr. Peavy since that meeting and understand that Middle States is asking us to first resubmit our self-study for Standard V in its entirety (using the new 14th edition standards), show proof of compliance with DoD Institutional Review Board policies, standard II, and third submit our completed Implementation plan to the NDU Strategic Plan for Standard VI.

Again, it is important to emphasize that Monitoring Reports are relatively common and NDU remains accredited throughout the process.

Next slide please.

<Slide 5>

NDU response activities after receiving the notification letter: we immediately got to work to address the commission's request and examine our programs in the specified areas. A working group was created and comprised of representatives from across the university. This Working group meets with me weekly and provides bi-weekly updates to General Plehn.

Four subordinate teams were established to address specific areas of our response:

First, the Standard II team, led by Dr. Denise Natali, the INSS Director, to develop NDU policies and processes to comply with federal and DoD Human Subjects Research Protection Program regulations.

Second, the Standard V team, led by Dr. Brian Buckles, the Dean of Faculty and Academic Programs at the Eisenhower School, to assess NDU compliance with Middle States Standard V based on the 14th edition criteria, identify gaps and corrective steps, gather evidence, and write the response.

Third, the Standard VI team, co-led by Steve Heffington and Ken Kligge, to develop NDU's Implementation Plan (I-Plan) to the NDU Strategic Plan: Realizing the Vision 2022 to 2027.

Fourth, an Evidence Team, co-led by Jennifer Laski and Jennifer Russell, to help gather and organize the evidence that supports the work of the other teams.

More recently, we added a fifth team, which is focused on beginning the planning for the logistics of the follow-on evaluation team visit, and that team is being led by Dr. John Yaeger.

A working group also met with Dr. Peavy, to better understand Middle States' expectations and findings. These meetings helped provide clarity to our efforts and shaping the responses. Additionally, early in the process, we met with some members of the self-study evaluation team to gain their perspective on NDU's evaluation in March and the notification of noncompliance. Finally, members of the working group met with and collected materials from other academic institutions in order to better understand best practices in the areas of human-subject research protection programs and institutional effectiveness assessment. Specifically, Naval Postgraduate School, Air University, Marine Corps University; and I also met with the President of the Consortium of Universities of the Washington Metropolitan Area.

Following these initial conversations, the working group and teams have been heavily focused on assessing the gaps in NDU's compliance with the standards for accreditation, largely informed by conversations we had with Middle States and various experts; Identifying the corrective actions needed to ensure NDU is in compliance and meets the standards defined by Middle States; Gathering appropriate evidence to show NDU compliance, or where there is no evidence, understanding why and correcting it; and finally writing our draft Monitoring Report.

This cyclical process has been in motion since early August of this year and will continue until we complete the final version of our report. We recently completed

draft 3 and plan to have draft 4 completed by the middle of December.

We have been aided in these efforts by three expert consultants brought on board to red team our work and provide critical feedback to our products. Each of these consultants has substantial expertise and experience in assessments and accreditation. Additionally, our Standard II team, in particular Dr. Kim Cragin and Dr. Bryce Loidolt, have worked closely with the OSD [Office of the Secretary of Defense] office that oversees DoD human-subject research protection program to develop our policies and processes.

After delivering the final Monitoring Report by 16 January, our focus will quickly turn to preparing for the follow-on evaluation team visit in late February or mid-March. This will include a series of faculty preparation sessions, articles in our internal newsletter, the Sunday Skim, and mock interviews with our external consultants to ensure the entire NDU team understands our response and any policy or process changes.

Next slide, please.

<Slide 6>

As the working group and teams assessed our gaps, we discovered there were areas where NDU either needed to provide additional guidance or lacked guidance altogether. The four documents you see on the screen now were either updated (in one case), or created new (in three cases) to address areas of concern discovered through the process.

These documents focused on clarity of reporting relationships and planning processes, the DoD Regulation 5100; establishing, for the first time, NDU guidance for human-subject research protection, the NDU Instruction 9010.01; establishing, for the first time NDU guidance on educational assessment processes, Instruction 9020.01; and operationalizing the NDU Strategic Plan (Strategy of the Future Implementation Plan) by setting clear ownership and performance indicators for the initiatives.

Since providing the briefing slides to the Board of Visitors, in addition to the Human-Subject Research Protection Program instruction, the instruction on Educational Assessment has been approved and issued, so that too, should have a green check mark next to it.

Next slide, please.

<Slide 7>

It is one thing to respond to the Middle States Notification Letter through the Monitoring Report. However, the main goal of these efforts is to ensure NDU remains an institution of excellence through full compliance with both the Joint Professional Military Education certification requirements and the Middle States Standards of Accreditation and Requirements of Affiliation. To sustain this compliance, we plan to focus on the four areas you see on this slide.

Policies and Processes – the three new policies plus our implementation plan shown on the previous slide, all go a long way towards strengthening NDU’s processes for institutional effectiveness and human subject research.

Oversight -The Office of Academic Affairs began a reorganization in the spring of 2023, which is still taking shape with the addition of two new Associate Provosts: Associate Provost for Educational Innovation and Educational Effectiveness, and the Associate Provost for Academic Programs and Faculty Affairs. Additionally, a component office for Human-Subject Research Protections has been created to ensure continued compliance with laws and regulations pertaining to human-subject research. This office falls under the Institute of National Strategic Studies (INSS) Director, who also serves as the university’s senior designated official.

Stakeholder Involvement – NDU recently created a new Committee on Educational Effectiveness Assessment, to be chaired by new Associate Provost for Educational Innovation and Institutional Effectiveness, Dr. Kate Kuehn. This committee will meet regularly to assess how well NDU assessment programs are performing and make recommendations for improvements. This committee will report to the Dean’s Council and connect into every college. Additionally, you, the Board of Visitors will continue to play a vital role in NDU governance, and your involvement is critically important to keeping us accountable to accreditation standards. You play a critical role to our sustaining these processes and we will continue to keep you apprised of our efforts in these and other accreditation related areas.

Data – Finally, regarding data, we look forward to the full implementation of NDU Connect, our new enterprise data management platform and student information system. It will provide us with better information, strengthening our ability to capture and analyze student assessment data and communicate meaningful insights

to decision makers as discussed.

NDU is actively working to produce a high quality monitoring report that will hopefully be well received by the Commission in June. The monitoring report requirement forced us to take a deeper look at ourselves and helped us identify several areas that needed attention and improvement.

We have embraced this accreditation review opportunity across the NDU enterprise to reinforce our overarching commitment to be the nation's premier national security university.

Finally, I should note that there is a high probability that NDU will be required to submit a second monitoring report, approximately 6 to 12 months after the Middle States Commission meets in June.

Mr. Chairman, subject to your questions, that concludes my presentation.

<Slide 8>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you, Provost. Two questions - 1) just to give us a sense of scale, what, to what degree does the university conduct human subject research? How many events? What's the scale of that activity?

Dr. Lepse: Yes sir, I'll give a preliminary answer and then with your permission, I'll ask Dr. Natali to elaborate if she would like to. But the vast majority of our research, student research and faculty, isn't human subject research per se, in certain ways. So the scale varies by college, by program. We've set it up on our SharePoint site, it's been very well constructed by the team, where students or faculty will put in their research proposals, criteria and go through a series of questions to determine whether it falls under the human subject research protection requirements. And, I would say, the vast majority of ours do not. But, they go through the process, and it's really quite streamlined to determine whether it is. So the vast majority of them don't fall under that, but I'll refer to Dr. Natali.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Is it single digits, is it double digits, is it triple digits?

Dr. Denise Natali, Director of the Institute for National Strategic Studies: General Schwartz, over 85 percent of the applications and research are considered exempt, so as Dr. Lepse said, the vast majority are exempt, but you will have about ten or fifteen percent that are not exempt, and then therefore will need to go

through, an additional process. Over.

Lt Gen Plehn: And we've had several dozen already go through that process?

Dr. Natali: Yes, we have. We continue to do that. I am pleased again to say, NDU is in compliance right now with regulations.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Got that, double digits, thank you. And finally, what do you foresee as the role of the board in the March 2024 visit from Middle States?

Dr. Lapse: Yes sir, the information we've been given on the visit in March is it'll be a shorter visit than we had in the previous March. It'll be a smaller team too. If you recall, the previous one was about, I think we had eight evaluators. The team coming here will have three evaluators, plus Dr. Peavy will be attending too, and we've been in constant contact with him throughout this process. They are going to come – the first will be just to check in the first night to make sure everything's running. But really, it's a one day visit, and then the second day of it will be the outbrief. We anticipate they'll be finished by about ten in the morning or so that [second] day. The president of the university, at his discretion, can invite whoever he wants for that outbrief, but I would hope that Board members that are available would attend that outbriefing.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: We're certainly eager to be supportive, and if you can you let us know, for calendar purposes, what the needs are, we'll respond accordingly. Thank you.

Dr. Lapse: Yes, sir. I will add that we have provided the Middle States Commission several different windows of opportunity where it would be convenient for the university to have them visit. They have yet to come back to us because they are in the process of identifying the team members. And once they identify the team members, we will clarify the date, and then from there, I will work with the team lead on the agenda and then let you know what the agenda looks like.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Sure. Sooner is better for all of us, thank you.

Dr. Lapse: Yes, sir. Understood.

COL (Ret.) Marcos: And also, any prep in advance of that visit, we're happy to support.

Dr. Lepse: Great. Thank you, ma'am. Thank you.

AMB (Ret.) Myrick: Relatedly, is there consideration of putting into place a system to sustain communications with Middle States during these periods that I hear you say [may be] six months? [During] gaps where you may have teams that are in constant contact over the periods? It should help avoid surprises, such as the one that we have experienced.

Dr Lepse: Yes sir. Since we've received the notification of non-compliance, I've been in regular contact with Middle States. We have our assigned liaison, Dr. Peavy, the Vice President for Institutional Outreach. Myself and Dr. Kuehn, who's going to be our ALO, Accreditation Liaison Officer with Middle States. The two of us will be in contact with them throughout. And, I've learned through this process the importance of staying in close contact with Middle States throughout this, even not under the requirement of the monitoring report. I also envision hopefully in the future we will be able to have some of our faculty or key leaders participate in some of their site visits because those are valuable for seeing best practices in other institutions. And so, they are looking for candidates for volunteers to be on the evaluation teams. And I think it would be beneficial for us to have a few.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Dr. Patil, Dr. Logan?

Dr. Patil: No questions at this time.

Dr. Logan: I would just say that I think that the last thing the Provost brought up about participation, forgive me, I'm trying to turn this camera on, I can't tell if it's on or off. There! About participation in accreditation visits at other universities is very important. Not only does it give NDU faculty and administrative staff the opportunity to see what other universities are doing, it also gives the other universities and the accreditation staff the opportunity to get to know you better. So, it seems like it may take time, and not be something you want to spend time doing, but I think it will bring dividends in the long run. Thank you.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you, ma'am. Any other questions from the members here? Thanks very much, Provost.

Dr. Lepse: Thank you, sir.

Lt Gen Plehn: Mr. Chair, at your discretion, we are progressing nicely through this, so we could either take a short break or roll into the next presentation.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Can we take a break since Jody elected to take a break?
(General laughter)

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Let's take a break.

Lt Gen Plehn: Sir, if you concur, we'll come back at 1015.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Yes, please return at 1015.

**1015-1050 Facilities, Technology (NDU Connect) & Manpower
 (Hiring) Updates
 Ms. Kathryn Kolbe, Chief Operating Officer**

Gen (Ret) Schwartz: Ms. Kolbe, you're on next.

<Slide 9>

Ms. Kolbe

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

Good morning, General Schwartz and distinguished members of the board. The last time we met in May I provided an overview of the various strategic initiatives underway within the NDU operations support enterprise.

During today's update I will cover NDU's resourcing outlook and budget profile, some facilities updates for Eisenhower and Roosevelt, and IT modernization progress.

Next slide, next slide please.

<Slide 10>

<Slide 11>

Once the FY24 appropriation is passed, we anticipate a better budget year ahead, totaling \$116.8 million for operations and maintenance, realizing \$9.3 million in plus-ups to support facilities maintenance and \$4.8 million for furnishings, fixtures, and equipment to support the restoration and modernization of Eisenhower Hall.

We will maintain momentum on our positive hiring trajectory to hire up to 361 direct funded staff and faculty, with an estimated 10% increase in the civilian pay budget in the next fiscal year.

In addition, OSD and the Joint Staff have agreed to accelerate procurement funding this fiscal year, based on requirements laid out in our POM [Program Objective Memorandum] issue paper, to modernize NDU's auditoriums, SCIF [Sensitive Compartmented Information Facility] spaces and IT system management tools.

Next slide.

<Slide 12>

Before I brief the budget profile, I'd like to introduce our new CFO Mr. Jon Kraft, who's with us today. Jon is retired U.S. Army. We're glad to have him on the team.

The President's Budget, shown here, reflects only the NDU direct funds as requested in the FY 24 budget request. The final enacted amount may be subject to change, and we anticipate an additional \$18 to \$20 million in reimbursable funds to meet NDU's reimbursable requirements.

The amounts displayed for FY21 through FY23 represent the actual obligations and in FY24, you can see Civilian Pay comprises approximately 50% of NDU budget, and although we are authorized 391 Full-Time Equivalents, we anticipate our affordability will be capped at around 361 staff on-board by the end of FY24.

The FY24 non pay O&M account within the operations and maintenance line remains flat and will not keep pace with inflation.

The largest increase, as I said earlier in FY24 is facilities sustainment, restoration and modernization for the facilities, operations and maintenance support specifically for facilities, operations and maintenance contract, which has not existed at NDU for many years, as well as the Eisenhower Building, furnishing fixtures and equipment to fit out that facility for its future occupancy.

I would like to stress that the budget does not include sufficient funding to hire all 391 authorized personnel, which is estimated to cost approximately \$63.7 million. Nor does it include \$65 million to support the restoration and modernization of Roosevelt Hall, as it's currently estimated at 65% design.

<Slide 13>

Next slide. Next slide, thank you.

<Slide 14>

Also with us today is our HR Director, Mr. John Freeman.

This slide shows the progress we have made in getting our staffing levels back to where they were before the pandemic and reducing the time it takes to bring new staff and faculty onboard.

We have been making steady progress in overcoming the 20% decline in staffing levels shown between 2015 and 2021 in order to reach authorized staffing levels, and we remain focused on bringing people with the right skills and talents to the university.

It has been a collective effort by leaders and managers across the enterprise which has led to an increase in overall net strength over the last two years. Between 2022 and 2033, we have realized a net gain of 41 new hires to the university.

We are also improving efficiency within our hiring process; in FY23 we reduced the time to hire for Title 5 staff by 44% and Title 10 staff and faculty by 38%, bringing candidates on-board 3 months faster than was done in previous years.

Next slide.

<Slide 15>

<Slide 16>

Transitioning to NDU facilities, NDU operates and maintains one million square feet of facility space at three separate campus locations – Fort McNair here in Washington D.C., the Naval Support Activity Hampton Roads in Norfolk, and Fort Liberty in North Carolina. The Army and Navy hosts at each site have consistently been unable to provide the level of support or funding required for facilities operations, maintenance and sustainment that would maintain NDU's facilities within code and prevent building and facilities support system failures.

Lack of funding has resulted in the declining condition of the NDU academic facilities on both campuses and the closure of the largest joint master's degree granting institution, the Eisenhower School, for a total of five going on six years.

Eisenhower Hall is the 140,000-square foot home to the Eisenhower School. The facility was dedicated by President Dwight D. Eisenhower on Sept 6th, 1960, as the Industrial College of the Armed Forces. President Eisenhower had previously served as an instructor at the former Army Industrial College, and the building is eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. Eisenhower Hall is currently undergoing a comprehensive restoration and modernization effort due to water intrusion and mold bloom, which became a life-health-safety issue for the students, staff and faculty in 2019.

During the construction period, faculty and students from the Eisenhower School are operating out of Lincoln and Marshall Halls, sharing space with others, limiting their dedicated space for students and faculty.

The restoration of Eisenhower Hall includes replacing the roof, repairing the interior and exterior building envelopes to prevent water intrusion, redesigning and replacing the HVAC and mechanical systems, installing new IT systems, renovating and recertifying the SCIF, and providing improved stormwater management. The current cost of the project is \$44 million with an estimated additional \$10 million for information technology and security requirements, which are currently in design.

The project is approximately 22% complete with an estimated completion date of February 2026. As General Plehn mentioned, the original estimated beneficial occupancy date was February of 2025, but this has shifted a year due to unexpected site conditions that have delayed the project's completion, although the Army Corps of Engineers is working with the construction contractor to try and mitigate those impacts and make up some of that time.

The closure of Eisenhower Hall and the displacement of the staff, faculty and students, into NDU swing space, makes it even more important that all buildings at NDU are properly maintained. As we prepare for the comprehensive restoration and modernization of Roosevelt Hall, there will not be swing space available until Eisenhower Hall reopens.

Next slide.

<Slide 17>

The National War College's Roosevelt Hall is currently experiencing some of the same issues as Eisenhower Hall prior to its closure. Roosevelt Hall was originally home to the Army War College and was dedicated by President Teddy Roosevelt in 1907. The last major renovation occurred in 1997. Roosevelt Hall is designated as a National Historic Landmark as a 112 year old neoclassical style building.

The 119K square foot historic building's critical facility concerns include extensive failure of the building envelope, much like Eisenhower, as well as internal infrastructure system failures associated with mechanical, electrical, and heating ventilation and air conditioning systems. The restoration and modernization design is currently 65% complete at its current cost estimate of \$65 million. The 100% design will be ready by March of 2024, and our strategy at NDU is to secure the necessary funding in FY25 to award this restoration and modernization project next fiscal year and begin construction in FY26.

The major components of this restoration and modernization project include replacing the roof, the mechanical and electrical systems, all windows, repairing masonry and structural issues, renovating the bathrooms, and addressing life-safety, water infiltration and asbestos throughout the facility.

The project will also entail a complete IT infrastructure upgrade, which includes re-cabling the entire building, modernizing conference rooms, and updating the auditoriums and common areas. These improvements will help ensure high-speed connectivity, advanced audiovisual systems, and interactive technology, to support enhancing the learning environment for staff and faculty.

While these two projects are in design and construction, we are also preparing to update the NDU capital investment strategy with the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers for our remaining buildings that require capital investment throughout all of our campuses.

<Slide 18>

<Slide 19>

Transitioning to the next topic of information technology, I'd like to introduce our Chief Information Officer, Mr. Jim Lowery, a former Marine, who came on board with us in April of this year.

The university's IT infrastructure, which was quite antiquated prior to receiving a \$78M plus-up across the FYDP [Future Years Defense Program] starting in 2019 continues to require modernization investment. Our efforts to move to the cloud, improve our IT network infrastructure, and modernize the university's auditoriums and classrooms are improving academic delivery and the student experience. Several organizational milestones are also supporting the modernization of our information technology infrastructure and transforming how the university does business across all aspects of the IT enterprise.

Over the last 3 years, NDU has been developing an enterprise data management platform as General Plehn shared with you. It's referred to as NDU Connect. It was developed with the Salesforce platform or software leveraging their specific education data architecture, which is used by hundreds of higher education institutions across the country. I'm pleased to report that the student information system portion of NDU Connect has reached Initial Operating Capability and will be implemented by all academic programs in three waves from this fall through next summer.

New capabilities on the platform include the ability to streamline recruiting, admission, enrollments, and registration of students; providing a method to query and report on data to support institutional research; tracking academic curriculum from creation through retirement; creating a single repository for managing all alumni data; as well as student support services, operational support services, human resources, information technology, and financial management.

We are also leaning forward to improve our cyber security posture. We requested a staff assistance visit prior to the CCRI, which we are currently undergoing with the CCRI Team. As we discussed earlier, it is identifying key areas of risks and vulnerabilities and wherever possible we will mitigate these identified risks during the inspection which will end next week.

Our CIO, Mr. Jim Lowery, has been working hard to identify highly skilled professionals to fill key leadership positions across the IT enterprise. He has created a software application division, restructured network operations and cybersecurity management, and has updated the IT support contract requirements, which is currently in acquisition and will be awarded early next year.

As a result of two years of advocacy for continued modernization of the IT enterprise infrastructure, I'm pleased to report that NDU received funding in FY23 from OSD to update the end-of-life wireless infrastructure, which does present cyber security vulnerabilities to the institution, but also to the academic environment across both campuses. The wireless infrastructure will be updated and OSD directed the Joint Staff to fund an additional \$47.8 million over the FYDP to address NDU auditorium audio-visual upgrades, SCIF improvements and replacement of the IT management system across NDU.

In summary, our leadership team has made great strides in improving the university through successfully advocating for significant additional resources to address facility deficiencies, to accelerate hiring and modernize information technology infrastructure. The advocacy of the Board of Visitors and the NDU Foundation have been instrumental in NDU's progress. The most pressing resourcing requirements going forward are the \$65 million Roosevelt Hall Restoration and Modernization project in FY25 and additional civilian pay budget to support the hiring of all 391 authorized NDU personnel.

This concludes my presentation.

<Slide 20>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you very much. I think the entire board would agree with my sense that given we've been at this for about eighteen months or so together, that the prospects for supporting infrastructure and what have you for the university, the outlook is much improved over what it was twelve or eighteen months ago. So hats off to you and your team for that.

Two questions that I have:

Given that you have 65 percent for \$65 million for Roosevelt - what vehicle do you all intend to use to try to secure funding in '25? Is it an unfunded request? Is it an issue paper? What vehicle do you intend to use?

Ms. Kolbe: We have to do two things, sir. We have to work with the Army to make sure there's a placeholder, as this is an Army installation, in their facilities program to support that requirement. That will be one parallel process. The other parallel process will be to engage with our stakeholders, both in the building as well as perhaps on the Hill when we do congressional engagement.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Got it. Thank you. Second, in the eventuality there is not an appropriation for '24, have you given thought to what adjustments might be required in such an eventuality?

Ms. Kolbe: Yes, sir. We would certainly not be able to do, probably, in particular, a lot of the procurement and modernization that we had planned, but we will plan for that because we expect from working with the Joint Staff that will be reprogrammed O and M [Operation and Maintenance] to procurement, and so we don't expect to get it until the end of the year. So we will plan for it regardless to be ready should the money come to us. But that would probably be the most likely impact to the operations support to the university.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you. Other questions?

The Honorable Debra Wada: No questions.

Dr: Patil: Yes. It's DJ. One aspect that I'm...

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Go ahead, sir.

Dr. Patil: Thank you. One question that I'm wondering about - given how fast technology is changing, especially with the IT side, how are we at NDU thinking about not only cloud applications, but the increased use of generative AI tools that people might be using? And whether that's, and you can pick your favorite vendor/solution of those, but I just wonder how we think about the associated cost of the support technologies given that we have these budget gaps already, and how much dependency we know will be coming ahead of us on these technologies.

Lt Gen Plehn: Mr. Chairman, if I could point to our Eisenhower School Commandant who has a pilot program underway.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Please do.

Major General William H. Seely (USMC), Commandant of the Eisenhower School: Good morning, sir, everybody, ladies and gentlemen. Bill Seely here from the Eisenhower School. We've, I've asked my staff and faculty to implement just a simple tool, and that's the OpenAI ChatGPT software piece at the moment. We are currently running a pilot within our national security exercise, in which across our twenty seminars conducting a scenario, one of them has been designated with a quote unquote "virtual student" using ChatGPT. Questions, comments, analysis being run through that particular one seminar.

In addition, we've added, if you will, virtual seminars number twenty-one and number twenty-two, in which faculty members will then run also the same scenario through their own inputs with the same "deliverables" as the students. In the end, we're hoping to have twenty three sets of data, of which, obviously nineteen, if you will, will be human only, and then the the other three sets of data incorporating ChatGPT with human analysis, and then of course, strictly two of those datasets within the construct of just ChatGPT. That's the first phase.

Second phase is – we’re going to implement what I call “Virtual Ike.” So that’ll be, no kidding, a singular ChatGPT student to run across our Military Strategy and Warfare class this coming semester. Also running through the various learning objectives, questions, comments, that will be gathered during class. The same questions will be run through, including essays, the ChatGPT construct. And again, we’ll be looking at this data in the long run to see where we are. We have to, and again, I think we all agree that we’re at this impasse with generative AI and technologies. Over.

Ms. Kolbe: If I could add to your question, DJ, from an operations support perspective, we started looking last year at about a hundred academic and business support processes across the university that were very manual. We are in the process of slowly automating those processes to be more efficient in how we do business in supporting the academic mission. And, with that, we are using our existing technology stack to automate those business processes, and also looking for opportunities to apply AI in the application of those applications, and in doing that work, to streamline how we’re doing the work, and essentially, to save manpower in the long run, to make it more efficient and easier for our staff to do their work.

Dr. Patil: One thing I would highlight – one, I would like to applaud your engaging in these pilot programs. The second is, I would really encourage you to think about budgetarily there’s going to be a box, if you will, that will need to go to generative AI technologies over the next few years. It’s obviously rapidly evolving, but in every organization that I see today, that portion of the budget is now moving further from this inception seed component to a sprout portion of the budget. We only expect the dollars that are required to go to that, to grow. And there’s obviously a whole slew of different aspects of this generative AI tech explosion that came during an explosion of products and tools coming out. And I’m more than happy to set up a separate session with NDU to talk through, explore what we’re seeing on the development of these, assessments that we also see across the national security apparatus.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: DJ, you’re on.

<Laughter>

Dr. Patil: I realize what I've signed myself up for.

<Laughter>

Dr. Patil: This is not an AI generated comment.

<Laughter>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Indeed, indeed. Nora?

COL (Ret.) Marcos: A couple things – one is, back on your slide six you show an improving trend on turnover. Sorry wrong slide, well anyway– staffing and hiring trends?

Ms. Kolbe: I'm with you.

<returns to slide 14>

COL (Ret.) Marcos: Do you know how this compares to industry, whether it's DoD or EDUs, and any effort to continue to improve that trend?

Ms. Kolbe: Yes, we are at about 16% attrition on an annual basis – I think that's what you're referring to.

COL (Ret.) Marcos: Right

Ms. Kolbe: Right, and we would like that number to be lower. My HR Director tells me that we should be under 10%. And so, we are striving to get there. I don't know what the industry standard is, but I think from within the government and the public sector, typically right under ten percent. And so, we are, we have been talking about emphasizing professional development, and focusing on the development of our employees. I would highlight that in the last few months we've just started a virtual coaching program in partnership with the United States Air Force - the Navy is doing this as well - with BetterUp, which is giving us – it's not only helping to develop those individuals, but it's also going to be giving us feedback on how they see themselves and how they see the organization. And some

challenges that we can focus on, some areas where we can focus on improving the organization to better support our staff and faculty.

COL (Ret.) Marcos: Thank you. Next one was – when you briefed us last year, we talked about budget execution. You weren't at 100% last year, you might have been about 97%. How did you all do this year?

Ms. Kolbe: We were at 100%.

COL (Ret.) Marcos: Awesome. And the last is a public service announcement for Dr. Lewis. I was in Europe, and I was receiving a briefing from the IT leader at USACE, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, and as I was looking in his office, he had a certificate from the CIO course from NDU. Made my heart go pitter patter. I brought it up. I think, when I look at IT leaders across the DoD, they all have an objective to educate our cyber workforce. So I'd like to, not now, but maybe next meeting, see how you're doing that, but also see how the program is evolving to include ChatGPT and those kinds of things. So, sorry to give you an attagirl and a tasker.

<laughter>

COL (Ret.) Marcos: But, it's something, you know, that I've always thought of – NDU is so focused on the strategery, but that educating the cyber workforce is so big, as a need, and we can probably do more to elevate what NDU does in that space.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Approved.

<laughter>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Please.

Vice Admiral Jody Breckenridge, USCG (Ret): Can I just follow up on Nora's question on the employees. Do we know why, the reasons for the high attrition rate of our employees?

Ms. Kolbe: Part of it, we know, is that we are a relatively small organization, and so, we have a lot of turnover, particularly with staff that want higher graded positions that we do not have here at NDU. Folks come in, particularly, maybe perhaps at lower grades, and they do well, and they want to move on. And, this is not uncommon in particular career fields. IT, also finance, procurement – it is very hard to hold on to people because they're in high demand across the government, and the private sector in some cases.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: That is particularly true when and if they hold a security clearance.

Ms. Kolbe: Mmhmm.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: One quick point, just from my own experience, that it might be helpful to establish a target for retention - I know in our case it's 5%. Others in a similar area and to measure yourselves as related to that target. Additionally, does the university do an engagement survey?

Ms. Kolbe: We do.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: When was the last one?

Ms. Kolbe: We do several surveys. We do the Defense Equal Opportunity survey, we do the Federal Employee Viewpoint Survey, and we have done an engagement survey with McKinsey that was, I'd have to get back to you on the exact date.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Yeah, well the Federal one probably would work, typically one gains good insight...

Ms. Kolbe: Yes, sir.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: ... trends, opinions, and attitudes in the workforce, so I certainly commend that.

Ms. Kolbe: Agreed

COL (Ret.) Marcos: On attrition – in the future, can you break it out between staff and faculty? Just so that we can see.

Ms. Kolbe: Yes. We have that data and happy to share that with you.

COL (Ret.) Marcos: Thank you.

Dr. Patil: The other one I'd recommend breaking it out, is by regrettable and not regrettable turnover, because there's always an inevitable turnover, I agree, that industry standards would be less than 10%. Now this gets a little challenging, because it's a small size, but if you think about five percent of regrettable turnover.

Ms. Kolbe: Will do.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: That might include the President, you know ...No, just kidding.

Ms. Kolbe: Thank you.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Other questions? Yes, Ma'am.

VADM (Ret.) Breckenridge: Well, a follow on comment to that is, I think you're operating in a bit of a unique environment right now with respect to the federal workforce. I know, in California, talking to our installations, as tough as recruiting may be for military, their number one challenge is hiring civilian employees. So it is particularly challenging now. Now we have a number of labs and research facilities and testing facilities in remote locations, especially out in the desert, that aren't desirable. Not a challenge here, but I think in general, and I would also offer contextually that some of the commentary going on in public spaces about the federal government and federal agencies is not particularly helpful for those who are trying to hire. So that's another contextual element, particularly for younger employees, because they don't have experience, don't necessarily know anyone who's worked [in the government]. So those are just additional layers that set the environment for you.

I did have one other comment or question regarding the budget. And that is, first of all, kudos to all of the staff here on your diligence and persistence and engagement

regarding facilities and the IT arena. The next challenge is sustainability, which is always a challenge. There is a tendency, particularly with infrastructure, to kind of wait until it's sort of critical and then start to deal with it, because there's not enough money to go around, so I get all of that.

But within this – so two pieces, first is with respect to traditional infrastructure, buildings and so forth. As you're doing the engagements, what is the strategy for addressing, now that we've made investments, making sure that we're getting some additional money to keep them up so we don't immediately start deteriorating again? And the second piece is sort of a follow up to what DJ offered, and that is, as you look at the upgrades for IT – I know in the finance world, we're just watching the cyber budgets continue to climb. I mean, there's lots of job guarantees there and AI is just adding to it. So, everybody's just upping their budgets, and kind of changing the boxes as was described. If we haven't thought about that, now is the time. We need to be ahead of the curve, not behind it. So, I'll turn that back over to you for any comments you'd like to offer.

Ms. Kolbe: Sure and thank you. The first item is, I think, also somewhat applicable here, based upon your experience, Ma'am, in California, the Cost of Living here in Washington, D.C. is also a factor. And so what our directors are doing – they're actually looking at all of our positions to see – are they graded properly. Because, if they can be graded at a higher level, to allow folks, to encourage folks to come here at the proper wage or salary – that can be helpful as well. So we have some of those same challenges.

The second item that you mentioned, for O and M. So the \$9.8 million dollar plus up you saw and that I mentioned for FY24, we actually received OSD support for that over the FYDP. We requested that over a year ago, and got support specifically for operations and maintenance. So, the challenge that we have is that we don't get sufficient funding for operations and maintenance, and that is intended to specifically maintain the facilities, for preventative maintenance, and corrective maintenance. We have trouble doing that right now, and that will be because we're relying on the Army and the Navy. And frankly, they have higher priorities due to the condition of their facilities. So that will address, as long as we can keep it in the budget, that will help to address what I think you're talking about there.

And the increases in the cyber budget, I do think our new CIO, Jim Lowry, is thinking through the increases, and every year, when we do an issue paper for submission to OSD, we will continue to identify new items, as DJ mentioned, for artificial intelligence, for cyber or any other developing areas in the IT space. Jim, do you have anything to add on that?

Mr. James Lowry, NDU CIO: No Ma'am.

Lt Gen Plehn: Mr. Chairman, if I can amplify that with a comment, please.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Go, please.

Lt Gen Plehn: Thank you, so also in our new strategic plan we do highlight three strategic initiatives, and one of those deals with the wargaming center and cyber labs, kind of conceptually wrapped up in that is how we do exactly what we've been describing here. So, we do have additional work to do as we go through our implementation plan, to lay out what we think that looks like in the future and how we intend to go about pursuing it. Over.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: One final comment on IT – I assume that you have classified networks here?

Ms. Kolbe: We do.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: And the demands from DCSA [Defense Counterintelligence and Security Agency] and others regarding DISA/DIA [Defense Information Systems/ Defense Intelligence Agency], regarding management of those systems is also accelerating. And that is also a resource issue going forward that drives IT budgets. So, the classified networks are of interest as well.

Dr. Logan, anything Ma'am?

Dr. Logan: No, I think all of my points were brought up by others, so I'm good. Thank you very much.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you. And thank you very much.

Ms. Kolbe: Yes, Sir.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Wonderful presentation.

Ms. Kolbe: Thank you.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: And, now we'll defer the break and ask for the ethics update from Dr. Lapse and Don Loren, please.

**1050-1116 Ethics Working Group Update
The Honorable Donald Loren, USN, (Retired), Distinguished
Professor of Practice, Eisenhower School**

<Slide 21>

Mr. Loren

There we go. Good morning distinguished Chair, Vice Chair, and Board of Visitors members. I'm Professor Don Loren of the Eisenhower School and it's my pleasure to brief you this morning on a subject that I know is of interest to all of us here. I am going to do something terrible and go off script for two seconds and tell you I just came from three hours in the classroom where we wrapped up the national security exercise, which was bringing together the courses of the first semester, both the National Security Strategic Policy, the Economics of National Security, the Industrial Mobilization course, and the SLFC course, the Strategic Leader Foundation course. And I have to tell you, you would all be absolutely pleased and profoundly impressed with the quality of what the students did during that exercise. And so, I'm on a high right now because it makes all of this worth it, and it puts together everything that your agenda is discussing, because that was the true outcome learning objective, to see those students deliver strategic, critically thinking, well formulated policy, and expertly defended discussion. So, makes all this worth it. So, forgive me President from going off script, but I think that's important and that's what we're all here for.

<Slide 22>

So, as you were all briefed at the May 2023 Board of Visitors meeting, the NDU President Memorandum of 27 March 2023 established the Charter of the National Defense University Ethics Program Coordinating Committee.

Each school and college has designated an Ethics and Leadership chair and the chairs, as members of the Ethics Program Coordinating Committee, which I'll refer to simply as the Committee, have met every month since examining that issue you General Plehn, and of course Provost Lapse have put certain tasks before us that we have started to dissect and put together. The Committee, following guidance emphatically endorsed by you as a board set out to look University wide at how we are addressing ethics, civil-military relations, and the profession of arms and national security across our curricula.

Slide two, please.

<Slide 23>

As you're aware, Institutional Learning Outcome #5 was established in March '23, formally tasking all University components to incorporate ethical leadership, civil-military relations, and profession of arms/national security subjects across all elements of their curriculum.

Dr. Greg Foster, long serving member of the Eisenhower faculty with extensive ethics and civ-mil relations instructor experience, has been formally assigned responsibilities as Ethics Concentration Director, overseeing the opportunity for students to broaden their knowledge of the subject as it applies to strategic, ethical leadership. Successful completion of the Ethics Area of Concentration, which you've heard from General Plehn earlier today, effectively constitutes a graduate minor and is specifically annotated on the student's official NDU transcript.

As part of the Committee's effort, each school and College was asked to identify how they were implementing the new ILO. As a result of this review, implementation initiatives were shared and best practices offered to all the schools and colleges of the University. Additionally, the University wide ethics concentration program was reviewed to ensure we were offering appropriate courses, with appropriate content to all of our students. Additional electives for inclusion in the concentration were solicited and are being developed university wide.

The schools and colleges were asked to incorporate the ILO 5 subjects of ethical leadership, civil-military relations, and profession of arms in all core courses and inclusion in individual course lesson syllabi issues for consideration.

Next slide, please.

<Slide 24>

The Committee met with retired U.S. Marine Corps General Peter Pace, the NDU Colin Powell National Security Leadership, Character, and Ethics Chair to glean his thoughts on how we could broaden our ethical leadership initiatives and ILO 5 issues. The Committee collected (and continues to collect) opportunities where we, as a senior war college should engage on ethics and leadership issues.

Next slide, please.

<Slide 25>

The Committee set some internal goals to guide our direction as we move forward. Chief among them is the sharing through this committee among NDU schools and colleges, the best practices for incorporating ILO 5 topics in all aspects of curricula development. Extending faculty outreach with other PME institutions, attending conferences, and faculty continuing education are other areas where we want to increase faculty participation.

Continuing to incorporate ILO 5 subjects in all core course offerings and new electives is also high on our list. Considering hosting ethics, civ-mil, and profession of arms/national security related symposia and conferences is another area we are exploring.

Working with the NDU press to encourage publication of related scholarly papers and articles. A Joint Force Quarterly and perhaps NDU Foundation co-sponsored contest soliciting papers on ethical leadership, civil relations is another venue we are currently exploring.

As mentioned previously by General Plehn, further review of the possible re-establishment of the NDU Ethics and Leadership Center is yet another area that we are planning to undertake.

Other concrete results of the Committee's efforts include the following:

- The addition of three lessons; Ethical Leadership, Civil-military Relations, and the Profession of Arms to the Eisenhower School Strategic Leader Foundation Course [SLFC]
- Assignment of the SLFC initial writing assignment on the ethical dilemma associated with the use of AI on the battlefield.
- Incorporating ethical subjects such as drone targeting, just war theory, weapons of mass destruction, and prisoner detention/interrogation are being factored into core JPME courses.
- Academic year 24-25 replacement of the Eisenhower School SLFC with a more focused Strategic Leadership Course is another concrete accomplishment.
- Addition of a 90 minute lesson on ethics and the profession of arms during the 10 week Joint and Combined Warfighting Course at the Joint Forces Staff College.
- To give you another example, academic year 24-25 addition of a focused study seminar on ethics and just war theory also at the Joint Forces Staff College
- Integration of strategic ethical leadership, civil-military relations, and profession of arms concepts in National War College courses NWC 6000 Introduction to Strategic Logic and Joint Warfighting; NWC 6220 Statecraft and the evolving character of war; and NWC 6600 National Security Strategy Practicum
- We've also conducted dialogue between the Committee and the U.S. Naval Academy Stockdale Center leadership and the U.S. Air Force Academy Center for Character and Leadership Development.
- We've had faculty and staff attend the annual McCain Ethical Leadership Conference at the U.S. Naval Academy, and committee members have completed the Harvard University Continuing Education Program in Ethical Leadership
- Conversation with The U.S. Army War College in co-hosting, perhaps even hosting the Joint Professional Military Ethics Working Group one-

day annual symposium is also something we are pursuing, and developing the University-wide mantra that ethical leadership is an important element of U.S. national power is something we've adopted.

Next Steps in the way ahead:

We would like to use NDU leadership network to attract renown subject matter experts for lectures and presentations, similar to what General Pace does and what you, General Schwartz, have done at the Eisenhower School, both in your capacity as board member and CEO of BENS.

Investigating the possibility of dedicated staff and faculty to devote to ethics, leadership, and civil-military relations, and profession of arms subjects.

Also, pursuing additional funding to support faculty professional development and outreach activities is an important undertaking.

We are looking at partnering with both Joint Force Quarterly and NDU Press and the NDU Foundation and exploring areas where we can work together on accomplishing these goals is also something we have in our sights.

That summarizes what we have accomplished in these past few months with respect to getting our feet firmly on the ground with respect to these subjects. Thank you all for letting me report to you. This concludes my presentation, subject to your questions and comments.

<Slide 26>

Dr. Logan: Sir, I have one question.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Go ahead, Dr. Logan.

Dr. Logan: I just need clarification please - you mentioned something about the leadership and ethics center, and I wasn't certain if it was a consideration of something that you'll be reviewing or something you plan to implement?

Mr. Loren: I think as I best understood that question, it was about the submission of ethics and leadership papers?

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: The question had to do with the center and the status of that. Is it just a gleam in the eye, or are we moving out?

Mr. Loren: We're really only in the elementary stages of trying to determine how the previous center atrophied, the causes. There is certainly great interest in trying to re-establish that, but as you can well imagine, it's going to take a little study and analysis of the resources required to put forward a concrete plan.

Lt Gen Plehn: Mr. Chairman, if I could amplify that? I would say it's not only a gleam in the eye, but a fire in the belly, but it's also a resourcing issue. Over.

Dr. Logan: Understood. Thank you, that's very helpful. I hope it remains a fire in the belly.

<laughter>

AMB (Ret.) Myrick: Could I just make an observation and ask for your views? You certainly have done some impressive things in this whole series of efforts of focusing on ethics and good behavior, basically, in how we do our professional work. But let me just ask something drawing on the excitement of your recent experience in the classroom, and if you could respond to this question. While we seem to be doing all the right things, we're covering all the right areas, how in your view, have the students internalized these values now, 'cause I have a sense that there's been a shift, a generational shift, in attachment to such values? Just curious to know your views based on your experiences.

Mr. Loren: Yes sir. Well thank you very much for that question. I agree with you wholeheartedly, that we, many of us in this room see generational shift, no question about that. And whereas General Schwartz is year group '73, I'm year group '74, so I think we certainly understand that generational shift. I think it's imperative, as it has been throughout everyone's - in this room - careers, is that the best way to emphasize these is, yes of course, classroom discussion and learning, and case study, but it really is by example. And by injecting that example into how our faculty conduct themselves, how you introduce these subjects in the national

security resourcing discussions, is imperative in making sure the students are aligned to sound philosophy with respect to these subjects. So, I agree, we all have to work hard to overcome generational shifts. We have to work hard to make sure they're introduced to the appropriate study, case study and reading, but we have to be the example of that.

AMB (Ret.) Myrick: Thank you.

LTG (Ret.) Hooper: A couple of quick comments – as you mention a number of organizations across DoD that you are liaising with and synergizing with, I'd like to suggest two others. The first one – and both of these are subordinate elements of the Defense Security Cooperation Agency. The first one is the Institute for Security Governance, which is out of Monterey, California and has responsibility for teaching many of our midlevel and senior international officers about these same subjects. And I'd suggest touching base with them. Another underutilized and below the radar resource for this type of thing is the Defense Institute for International Legal Studies, which is up at the Naval War College in Newport, Rhode Island, which teaches law of land warfare, law of armed conflict to many of our allied officers – you might want to touch base with them.

The last thing I'll mention is, and I hope it's not a blinding flash of the obvious, but we are about to enter what promises to be a regrettably fairly contentious election cycle. And we'd be remiss as leaders if we did not anticipate some of the challenges that might arise from that, that fall firmly within the realm of this. I'm not dictating or making any suggestions as to how we might address that, but it's coming. And it offers both potential challenges, but also opportunities, and we would be remiss if we do not think ahead to anticipate what might be coming in the next eleven months and how we might address that with our students.

Mr. Loren: Yes, sir – if I may respond. Excellent point. I know that was very much one of the key points of Gen Schwartz's presentation to the Eisenhower School. I know General Pace has mentioned that. And the Chaplain, and the lawyer at the Eisenhower School, Captain Galindez and COL Soussan, and I teach Ethical Strategic Leadership which will start up in January, and we do. One of our lessons does address that. We struggle with teaching the principles and the example and turning it into a compliance lecture, which is, of course, a dangerous fine line you have to be able to negotiate in the discussion. And the unfortunate thing is, next

semester we'll have six students. So, the point is we have to get out and reach more students. But you're exactly right and the timing of that makes it imperative that we figure out how as a university and respective colleges to address that.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Two comments to conclude: I think there are members of this Board of Visitors who would be eager to be supportive of this curriculum, and so I encourage you to think about how you might tap any one of us to support that. For example, I'd be happy to be part of this 6034 effort, as you know. Now let me make a point that is delicate and perhaps controversial, but a topic that I know I knew very little about in my service was something called the Insurrection Act. That might be a topic that we could address academically that might help future generations of leadership. Just a thought.

Mr. Loren: Yes, sir. As the former Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense for Homeland Security Integration, unfortunately I have had to look at the Insurrection Act a number of times, and it something that we need to incorporate in the instruction.

Dr. Patil: I would like to strongly emphasize that last point, and I would add another one, which is something that former SECDEF Carter and I spent a lot of time talking about. As we start to see the transitions around some of the new technologies, synthetic biology, quantum, and now we're seeing the particular relevancy around artificial intelligence, we know that the ethics frameworks that are being discussed around generative AI, and broader AI are inadequate for the applications that we're seeing. And then, additionally as we're starting to see these technologies being used in different conflict zones, this is going to be rapidly evolving, so given the tools, and the language of what we know really well in ethics frameworks previously, I would use that to start to encourage students to begin bridging into the space of extraordinary ambiguity that is going, that is already here, with these new technologies.

Mr. Loren: Yes, sir, understood and if I may, that emphasizes how important it is that we maintain close dialog with many of the institutions that look at this for having the most up to date case studies and the most up to date frameworks and discussions in the area, but you're exactly right, yes, sir.

VADM (Ret.) Breckenridge: Thank you for what you've offered and congratulations on all the headway that's already been made. Although there's still a lot to do, progress has certainly been made. You talked predominantly about the colleges, could you talk a little bit about what the vision is, the relationship between this initiative and Capstone, Keystone, and Pinnacle?

Mr. Loren: Yes ma'am. That is something that we really haven't branched out to and my colleague Gerry and I probably need to sit down and discuss that. I think that's a very valid point, and thank you for bringing that up.

Lt Gen Plehn: If I could reply to that, as I see both sides of that. We do have ethics focused aspects in Capstone, Keystone, and Pinnacle; they're just not tightly connected to what Don is doing, so I think there is space there for us comparing between the programs.

VADM (Ret.) Breckenridge: I would certainly hope they would have visibility with this particular initiative. And certainly as they go back out into the services, and to their agencies, it's entirely possible, certainly, we hope probable, that they would be engaging you as a Center of Excellence, as they look at the challenges they may face back in their jobs.

Mr. Loren: Yes, ma'am. No, that's a very valid point, and in fact, when General Pace comes to address the student body of the university, it's usually coordinated when he's here, to address Capstone, and I think that's a great point that we really need to look into.

AMB (Ret.) Myrick: Just reflecting on comments by colleagues on the board, I wonder if it will be useful to articulate a definition of what we mean by civil-military relations? Because I think it means different things to different people, and maybe this is something NDU can take on to design.

Mr. Loren: Yes, sir, it does, and we offer an elective in that. And again, Dr. Foster is the one, who is the instructor for that. And I agree with you, we have to make sure that, all our definitions are up-to-date and accurate. And we need to use, as we're trying to do with the entire subject matter, is to make sure all the most up to date and relevant definitions are incorporated throughout all our courses. So whether we talk about civil-military relations in the elective, or in an ethics course,

or in the National Security Strategy and Policy course, or in the industrial mobilization course, that it's all predicated on a sound foundation of what we're talking about.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: If I may, Mr. President, one of your...

Dr. Cassandra Lewis, Chancellor, College of Information and Cyberspace: Thank you, General, for allowing me to amplify a couple of examples that I think may tie together some of the comments and questions offered by the Board. I wanted to just follow up to note that in reference to, related to your comment on working with the ISG [Institute for Security Governance] as well as the Center for Legal Affairs. One of our faculty members, Dr. Jill Goldenziel, is developing an elective on lawfare, and she is also part of the Navy's working group on that same issue around lawfare. So I wanted you to know that in addition to the work done by the working group, in several other areas the concepts related to ethics, lawfare, some of those emerging topics, are embedded in our courses and programs in a lot of different ways, including our Warfare and Disruptive Technologies course that looks at the ethical implications of emerging technology, as well as the implications for the changing character of war, so it's covered. Thank you.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: I think this was an extraordinarily valuable presentation, and certainly one that each of us has a stake in, and of course, the profession has a stake in this, so many thanks, Don, for being a champion here, and to the president for your endorsing this. Once again, I think that the apparent, let me just say it plainly, a little bit of a disconnect between the colleges and Capstone should be closed without delay. Thank you.

Mr. Loren: Thank you, sir.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: And we'll, I recommend, Mr. President, that we go ahead and do the Conference of Commandants pitch.

Lt Gen Plehn: Yes, sir. I think we can do that fairly expeditiously. (General Laughter)

Dr. Lapse

<Slide 27>

Dr. Lapse

Yes, sir – we can do this expeditiously. With your permission, sir, I'll begin.

Please, next slide.

<Slide 28>

As previously stated, NDU will co-host with the NATO Defense College, the 53rd NATO Conference of Commandants from 7 to 10 May 2024 here at Fort McNair. The theme of this conference is “Developing leaders for the next 75 years of the Alliance.” It was agreed upon during the 2023 conference in Tallin, Estonia. Although NDU is deeply involved in planning the content of the conference, the NATO Defense College is ultimately responsible for the program agenda, format and guest speakers.

The first day will be a half day session. The primary focus of that session will be – Setting the Stage for Leadership Education and Training in NATO as a primer for the rest of the conference. In addition to the NATO Commandants, the next two and a half days will include Commandants from several other nations. Specifically, for the May 2024 conference, there will be 60 invited countries from NATO, the Partnership for Peace Consortium, non-NATO members from Asia, Africa, and the Middle East, and several other international security institutions. Attendance of actual participants is anticipated to be around 130.

The second and third days of the conference will have similar schedules, which will consist of a plenary session in the morning and breakout sessions in the afternoon. The plenary session each of those two mornings will start with a Keynote address plus a question-and-answer period, followed by a moderated panel discussion. Each of the two afternoons will have breakout sessions on three topics for 30 minutes each, and conference attendees will rotate through all three of the breakout sessions.

The focus of the second day will be a discussion on the future challenges and opportunities that will fundamentally alter the environment that future leaders will face.

The three afternoon breakout sessions will explore this topic in more detail with discussions on the contours of the future world, disruptive and emerging technologies, and NATO's future role.

The third day will focus on the implications for leadership competencies, specifically, given the future challenges and opportunities discussed on the previous day, what will be required in terms of competencies for leaders tomorrow?

The afternoon breakout sessions will examine the competencies leaders must possess in relation to coping with these new complexities, implications to ethics and values, and building an opportunities mindset.

The conference will conclude with a half-day session on May 10th to discuss how to best prepare leaders for operating at the strategic level. Specifically, we'll examine what senior-level strategic institutes need to do to ensure future leader development to meet the challenges and opportunities of the future.

In addition to the formal portion of the conference, the attendees will have the opportunity to build upon personal relationships while attending a Nationals baseball game and a dinner at the Army Navy Club.

We trust that the professional and personal relationships developed during the conference will facilitate continued collaboration and dialogue on this critical topic and others to ensure our education institutions are forward thinking and developing our leaders with the critical thinking skills to face the future operating environment.

So that concludes my presentation, subject to your questions.

<Slide 29>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Just a suggestion, and I'm sure there are others here, seems to me that the timing of this is of interest, but Jake Sullivan may be an excellent candidate to be the keynote speaker. Yes, he's a politico, but he's not a candidate.

Dr. Lepse: Yes sir, and we are working in collaboration with the NATO Defense College on the keynote speakers and the panel members for each of the panels during the plenary session.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Other comments? Okay, thank you so much.

Dr. Lepse: Thank you, sir.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Mr. President, and I know we've been expeditious so far today. I like that. I know. May I suggest – I know we have lunch beginning at 1230, and that's a hard time, so may I suggest that we break until 1230 for lunch, and that we all clear our inboxes or whatever we have? And let me just say that I take this morning's presentation as very upbeat, and, you know, the trajectory is far different than I recall eighteen months ago, so, hats off to the staff. And if I could make an unpaid sort of commercial announcement here, there is an event occurring in a little bit of time that's hosted by the NDU Foundation. There's some giants attending that event, and may I suggest that members of the Board consider attending. I think that will be a grand evening, and one that is well-suited to the reputation of NDU. With that, sir, I propose to break until 1230 down the hallway. Ma'am?

Ms. Stevens: So after lunch do you want to come back here?

Lt Gen Plehn: Yes, Joycelyn. Can I take that for a moment?

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Sure.

Lt Gen Plehn: Mr. Chairman, if I may make a recommendation, that if we are complete with the public business of the board meeting, that we might consider adjourning the public session, doing the break you recommended, having lunch, then reconvening for the administrative session after lunch. Over.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Any comments from membership?

<murmuring>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: That's why the president is president.

<Laughter>

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Certainly agree. Thank you. So, over to Joycelyn for closing comments.

**1122-1125 Meeting Ends
Ms. Stevens**

Ms. Stevens: Well sir, if you do want to do closing comments, then we can open it up to the board before I officially adjourn the meeting, close the meeting.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: I think we're fine – you can officially adjourn the meeting with those appropriate comments.

Ms. Stevens: Okay, perfect. All right the public session of the Board of Visitors, National Defense University is hereby ended in accordance with the provisions of public law 92-463. The Board members will meet for an administrative session in room 1651 of Lincoln Hall, and we will have NDU personnel escorting you to the meeting room. The administrative session will begin immediately after lunch, which will be...

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: 12:30 to 1:30.

Ms. Stevens: 12:30-1:30, so 1:45. So the meeting is hereby adjourned at 11:25 AM.

Gen (Ret.) Schwartz: Thank you for Dr. Logan and Dr. Patil. Thanks so much for joining us from afar.

Appendix A

National Defense University Board of Visitors Attendance Roster December 1, 2023

1. Vice Admiral Jody Breckenridge, USCG (Ret)
2. Lieutenant General Charles Hooper, USA (Ret)
3. Dr. Suzanne Logan ([virtual attendance](#))
4. Colonel Nora Marcos, USA (Ret)
5. Ambassador Bismarck Myrick (Ret) — Vice Chair
6. Dr. DJ Patil ([virtual attendance](#))
7. General Norton Schwartz, USAF (Ret) — Chair
8. The Honorable Debra Wada

Not In Attendance:

1. Dr. Chris Howard
2. The Honorable Tim Roemer



**National Defense University
Board of Visitors Meeting
December 1, 2023
AGENDA**

Meeting Dress Code

Military: Class A Uniform

Civilian: Business Suit

All Times Listed are in Eastern Time (ET)

Friday, 1 December 2023

Room 155A&B, Marshall Hall + Virtual Access for BOV members only

0900 (ET)	Call to Order – Open Meeting Starts <i>(Room 155A&B, Marshall Hall + Virtual Access for BOV members only)</i>	Ms. Joycelyn Stevens, Alternate Designated Federal Officer (ADFO)
0900-0905	Administrative Notes <i>ADFO comments/overview of agenda</i>	Ms. Stevens and General Norton Schwartz, USAF (Retired), BOV Chair
0905-1000	State of the University Address	Lieutenant General Michael T. Plehn, NDU President
1000-1045	Reaffirmation of Middle States Commission on Higher Education (MSCHE) Accreditation Update	Dr. James Lapse, Provost
1045-1130	Budget, Hiring, Facilities & Technology Updates	Mrs. Kathryn Kolbe, Chief Operating Officer
1130-1145	BREAK	
1145-1215	Ethics Committee Update	Dr. Lapse and The Honorable Donald Loren, USN (Retired), Distinguished Professor of Practice, Eisenhower School
1230-1330	<i>Buffet Lunch with Faculty and Staff Room 1302, Lincoln Hall</i>	<i>Board Members, NDU-P, SVP, Dr. Yaeger, ADFO, and Select Faculty and Staff (invitation only)</i>
1345-1415	NATO Conference of Commandants	Dr. Lapse and Mr. Dale Owen, Director of Operations Management

1415-1430	Discussion of Public Written Comments	Board Members
1430-1445	BOV Member Deliberation and Feedback	Board Members
1445-1500	Wrap-up and Closing Remarks	General Schwartz and Lieutenant General Plehn
1500	MEETING ENDS	Ms. Stevens